Identifying Cultural Authenticity within New Zealand Children’s Literature

By

Tessa Bowler

Submitted to the School of Information Management,
Victoria University of Wellington
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Information Studies

February 1, 2020
Contents

1. Abstract ........................................................................................................................................4
2. Introduction ...................................................................................................................................5
   2.1 Rationale for the Study .............................................................................................................5
   2.2 Research Questions ................................................................................................................5
   2.3 Initial Limitations of the Project ..........................................................................................5
3. Literature Review ..........................................................................................................................6
   3.1 Why Diversity in Literature Matters ....................................................................................6
   3.2 Cultural authenticity assessment frameworks for children’s books .....................................6
   3.3 Literature Review Summary ..................................................................................................8
4. Methodology ...................................................................................................................................9
5. Framework Analysis ....................................................................................................................10
       Published: 1992 .......................................................................................................................10
   5.2 Junko Yokota: Issues in Selecting Multicultural Children’s Literature. ..............................11
   5.3 Jennifer Johnson Higgins: Multicultural Children’s Literature: Creating and Applying an
       Evaluation Tool in Response to the Needs of Urban Educators. .........................................11
   5.4 Bena R. Hefflin and Mary Alice Barksdale-Ladd: African American Children’s Literature That
       Helps Students Find Themselves: Selection Guidelines for Grades K-3. ...............................12
   5.5 Elizabeth Ebony Thomas: Stories still matter: Rethinking the role of diverse children’s
       literature today .........................................................................................................................13
   5.6 Eliza G. Braden and Sanjuana C. Rodriguez: Beyond Mirrors and Windows: A Critical Content
       Analysis of Latinx Children’s Books .......................................................................................14
   5.7 Framework Analysis Summary .............................................................................................14
6. Application to a New Zealand Māori context .............................................................................15
   6.1 White Dominance and Colonisation in New Zealand ............................................................16
   6.2 Te Reo Māori and the Language Revival Movement ..............................................................17
   6.3 Māori Culture ........................................................................................................................19
7. New Framework ............................................................................................................................19
8. Discussion .......................................................................................................................................25
9. Limitations of the Project and Suggestions for Future Research ................................................. 28
10. Conclusion ................................................................................................................................. 28
11. References ................................................................................................................................. 30
1. Abstract

Research Problem

Within the United States there is a large body of work detailing the importance of cultural authenticity in children’s literature for non white children and how to identify it but no similar work has been attempted in New Zealand. This study aimed to determine whether or not this research could be applied to a New Zealand Māori context.

Methodology

An analysis of six frameworks from the United States was undertaken in order to identify what each researcher felt was the most important aspects of cultural authenticity within a text. These points were then used to create a new framework which was applied to a small group of New Zealand picture books to see if the framework would work in a New Zealand context.

Results

The study showed that both the United States and New Zealand have similar issues when it comes to supplying non white children with texts which reflect their own culture. It also showed that the framework developed is capable of helping librarians identify aspects of Māori cultural authenticity.

Implications

The research shows that if libraries are concerned about the amount of books they have that feature authentic Māori characters then a framework like this would be useful for selection purposes.

Keywords: cultural authenticity, New Zealand children’s literature, selection guidelines
2. Introduction

2.1 Rationale for the Study

Research tells us that children enjoy reading books that feature characters who look like them and contain details similar to their own lives (Bell & Clark, 1998). These same studies also tell us that for children who are not white it can be hard to find books that allow them to truly relate to a text in this manner (Hefflin B & Barksdale-Ladd, 2001, Kurz, 2012). While there has been extensive work done in the United States concerning both the availability of books about non-white characters and what can be considered authentic representation of a culture within children’s literature, little work has been done in this area from a New Zealand Māori perspective.

There is a clear knowledge gap within New Zealand libraries about authentic cultural representation is within New Zealand children’s literature. Without this understanding it can be difficult for librarians who are not Māori to ensure the books within their children’s collections are providing Māori children with the opportunity to read about characters that share their experiences. This research project is designed to build on the knowledge of cultural authenticity in children’s literature created in the United States and assesses whether or not current frameworks can be used to judge cultural authenticity within a New Zealand context.

2.2 Research Questions

1. Is there a current framework designed to assess cultural authenticity in children’s literature that can be used within a New Zealand context?

2. Can a current frameworks be adapted to assess cultural authenticity in New Zealand children’s literature?

2.3 Initial Limitations of the Project

This research project is limited in what it is able to address because I am Pākehā and therefore unable to comment on the specific needs of Māori children and what they most want to see in books about themselves. Therefore, this project is focused on applying knowledge from the
United States to a New Zealand Māori context rather than gaining Māori knowledge and using it to create a new framework.

3. Literature Review

3.1 Why Diversity in Literature Matters

Children deserve to read stories that reflect their own lives. Seeing themselves, their appearances, cultures and experiences reflected in the books they read is not only a more enjoyable experience, (Hefflin and Barksdale-Ladd, 2001 & Gangi, 2008) it is also shown to be more educational, as children are more likely to retain and think critically about the information in the books they read when they are able to make connections with themselves and the text (Bell and Clark, 1998). If a child is white there is no question that they will be able to find titles that allow them to experience the pleasure of seeing themselves reflected in a text (Kurz, 2012). However, accessing books that feature characters from non-white backgrounds which also portray non-white communities and cultures can be difficult. Books featuring multicultural characters are recommended less and win fewer prizes, (Hughes-Hassell, Barkley and Koehler, 2008 and Kurz 2012). They can also be harder to locate within a library and are often only displayed during certain times of the year, such as Black History Month or Chinese New Year, (Kumasi, 2012). This creates a situation where children from diverse communities have to work harder to find books that resonate with them and therefore, cannot acquire literacy skills as easily as their white counterparts.

3.2 Cultural authenticity assessment frameworks for children’s books

The first example of a framework by which to assess children’s book for cultural authenticity was created by Rudine Sims-Bishop in 1993. It simply asks if a book is neutral, generic or specific. Neutral books feature characters of colour but are about something else and do not mention race or culture, here the characters of colour are often secondary, acting as friends or classmates of the white main character, and are not essential to the plot. Generic books only address universal experiences, such as bullying or moving house with a character’s race only identified in the illustrations. Specific books successfully portray a non-white cultural group,
their childhood experiences, religion, language etc. and give children who are a part of this community the opportunity to truly connect with a text, (Sims-Bishop 1993). Specific books are what gives the children a chance to see their own culture reflected back at them, teaching them that their experiences are important and how they are connected to a wider community with the same culture as them (Bishop-Sims, 1990).

Since then efforts have been made to ascertain what makes a specific book, with researchers using more detailed frameworks to analyse specific texts in order to understand what elements are needed within a book in order for it to accurately depict a culture. Some studies have relied on using their own experiences as cultural insiders to inform their frameworks (Hefflin, B., & Barksdale-Ladd, M. 2001, Bishop-Sims 1992). Others chose to use previously published frameworks (Kurz, 2012, Yoo-Lee, Fowler, Adkins, Kim, & Davis, 2014 and Adam & Harper, 2016) two others chose to use a variety of previously published methods to create their own, (Yokota, 1993 and Higgins, 2000). All but one of these studies (Harper & Adam, 2016) are from the United States and the majority attempt to create a framework that will adequately analyse texts from a multicultural perspective, meaning that their one framework could potentially work to analyse any book from any cultural background. It makes sense that one multicultural framework would be the most desirable, this type of close reading and consideration takes time so having one tool which can be counted on to help with the selection of books from any background would be desirable for any librarian or teacher. However, the ones that do attempt to be this multicultural tool can end up being so long their usefulness comes into question. Higgins’ framework for example is 14 points, which could easily become too overwhelming to use.

The term cultural authenticity is used throughout many of these papers to explain what they are looking for in a book. It is an umbrella term which implies that a book meets the following criteria:

- Historically accurate details
- Authentic dialogue
- Well-developed non-white characters who are included for a purpose
- Culturally accurate details Culturally accurate relationships
- Free from racial stereotypes

The goal for any of these frameworks is to identify which books are capable of fulfilling these requirements. However, it is important to note that these terms mean different things to different cultural groups and some aspects of cultural authenticity are more important than others. For example, Mo and Shen, (2003) stress that books which feature Asian characters and stories need to display the cultural values of the social group, even if it means not being historically accurate. They use the example of Chinese foot binding within the book, *Mei Li* by Thomas Handforth (1939 as cited in Mo & Shen 2003). While depicting bound feet is historically accurate for the time period of the book, foot binding today is seen as an “emotional scar” culturally and Chinese choose to avoid mention of the painful practice. Here, the importance of cultural authenticity - an accurate representation of social practices today - is favoured over historical accuracy. (Mo & Shen, 2003). In direct comparison, Yokota (1993) critiques the book, *The Day Elvis Came to Town* by Jan Marino (1991 as cited in Yokota, 1993) because it depicts biracial marriage which was illegal in Mississippi during the 1950s. Here, we see a desire for books about African Americans to be historically accurate, even when biracial marriage is widely accepted today and that two cultures view the importance of historical accuracy and cultural authenticity in different ways. Those who do attempt to acknowledge these differences choose either to add significantly more questions into their framework, (Higgins, 2000) or revert back to Rudine Bishop-Sims original framework (Kurz, 2012, Harper & Adam, 2012) because its simplicity allows it to be applied to a variety of cultures so long as the user has a strong knowledge of that culture.

3.3 Literature Review Summary

The amount of work done concerning cultural authenticity within children’s literature shows that it is an important topic for those interested in children’s literature. This work demonstrates why it is so important for libraries to have inclusive collections that reflect the lives of their
diverse patrons back to them. This review also shows that while the broad ideas of cultural authenticity can be applied to a number of cultural groups throughout the United States it is important to recognise that each culture has their own history and own expectations of what to see in children’s literature about their culture.

4. Methodology

Similar research that has used previous frameworks to develop a new framework have not detailed their methodology in either their analysis of the original frameworks or their creation of a new one. Higgins, for example only said that they “considered” a variety of frameworks when designing their own, (Higgins, 2000). Other researchers, such as Bishop-Sims (1993) and Yokota (1993) did not need to detail how they designed their frameworks as their background as educators and experts in children’s literature as well as their position as a cultural insiders meant that their creation could be trusted without verification.

This project aims to be more methodical in its analysis of the original frameworks. Firstly because it will ensure that have a deeper understanding of the different frameworks and secondly, because a more structured approach means that others will be able to replicate on it in the future if required.

The first step is to analyse what each framework is aiming to highlight within a text and understand the context in which it was created. This will be done by asking three questions about each framework:

1. What cultural groups are being considered?
2. What aspects of the text is this framework focused on?
3. In what context was this framework created?

The first question is to give the reader a general context about the framework. The second will help show how the creators of the framework believe culturally authentic details are best displayed within a children’s text and how best to go about identifying these details. The third question will give a wider context around the development of thinking about culturally
authentic children’s books and help give a wider understanding of the author’s aims when suggesting how to select culturally authentic texts.

The second part of this research project will consider the Māori context and which aspects of these frameworks would be most useful when considering a New Zealand text. This will be done by identifying what the researchers who designed the original frameworks considered most important in regards to both cultural authenticity and also how to identify a text with racist themes or messaging. These points will then be taken and put in a New Zealand context in order to understand what Māori cultural authenticity would look like within a text and how racism towards Māori manifests itself in New Zealand.

5. Framework Analysis
The following section is presented in chronological order as these frameworks build on one another, using previous research to create new frameworks.

Published: 1992

What cultural group is being considered: Multicultural

What aspects of the text is this framework focused on: This framework is focused on how the non-white characters within the text interact with each other and if they are given an opportunity to display their culture to the reader. It does not mention wider themes within the text, choosing to assume that the children reading associate themselves with the character and if the character is able to demonstrate their culture that will result in cultural authenticity.

In what context was this framework created: Bishop-Sims is a pioneer in this field of research and hers is the first framework of this type. Her framework is the original and still used widely today (For example, New Zealand’s National Library recommends it for schools to use while planning their bulk borrowing). Her framework was designed to assist teachers in helping to find quality multicultural books for their classes and was focused on counteracting the overwhelming whiteness in American classroom reading lists.
5.2 Junko Yokota: Issues in Selecting Multicultural Children’s Literature.

**Published:** 1993

**What cultural group is being considered:** Multicultural groups. Unlike Bishop-Sims this framework also explicitly includes white cultural groups as well as racial groups such as Judaism or the people of Appalachia.

**What aspects of the text is this framework focused on:** Yokota is concerned with authentic cultural representation. Like Bishop-Sims, Yokota’s framework is centered on the characters and if they are given the opportunity to display or interact with their culture within the text but it chooses to be more explicit in what readers should be looking for than Bishop-Sims. For example, one of the five requirements for cultural authenticity is that minority characters are included for a purpose - something only implied within Bishop-Sims framework.

**In what context was this framework created:** This was published only a year after Bishop-Sims and is addressing the same problem of teachers and librarians not selecting enough books that can be considered culturally authentic.

5.3 Jennifer Johnson Higgins: Multicultural Children's Literature: Creating and Applying an Evaluation Tool in Response to the Needs of Urban Educators.

**Published:** 2000

**What cultural group is being considered:** Multicultural

**What aspect of the text is this framework focused on:** This framework shows the change between the original work which focused on the characters and the opportunities they were given to display their culture and the more recent frameworks which are more concerned with the wider meaning within a text. Higgins has chosen to focus on both, the characters opportunities to display their culture while also asking questions about who has the power within texts. The requirement that characters, “are not in need of help from a white authority figure” is particularly interesting as it implies that even if a character is culturally authentic the wider message of a book could still be racist and therefore unwanted within a classroom or library collection.
In what context was this framework created: This framework was created as a part of Higgins’ Doctoral Dissertation. Like this project she chose to take aspects of original frameworks and merge them to create her own, including the parts of each framework that she believed best helped identify cultural authenticity within a text. It shows one of the first instances of designing a framework which explicitly considers power dynamics within children’s literature and because of this has been cited many times in both academic essays and in blogs and educational websites for teachers and librarians.


Published: 2001

What cultural group is being considered: African-American

What aspects of the text is this framework focused on: This framework is focused on authentic and realistic and positive portrayals of African Americans within children’s texts. It is the first within this project to focus on one particular cultural group and as such is able to explicitly mention what is important for African American children to read such as illustrations that show accurate African American physical characteristics, not just characters coloured brown. This illustrates how a framework focused on one cultural group is able to identify a specific issue about how their culture is portrayed - in this case, illustrators not differentiating between white and African American bodies - and teach the users of this framework to be aware of this problem within children’s literature.

Unlike the Bishops-Sims and Yokota this framework asks the user to look for “aesthetically pleasing” and “positive” portrayals of African American characters. The accompanying essay is focused not just on identifying culturally authentic texts but also the positive effect reading these texts has on African American children - something the previous two touch on within the accompanying essays but do not include in their actual frameworks.

In what context was this framework created: There is an eight year gap between Yokota’s framework and this one. This is the most academic approach to the question of how to locate
culturally authentic children’s books seen so far and shows the development within the discourse of how to approach this question. Unlike the previous two frameworks, Hefflin and Barksdale-Ladd explain how they developed their framework, by adapting previous frameworks designed to help teachers identify quality children’s books and adding in specific questions about the quality African American cultural representation which was informed by previous work by Rudine Bishop Bishop-Sims and J.A. Banks as well as their own experiences as educators and cultural insiders. It also used research which had been completed since Bishop-Sims framework was published that proved that non white children respond better to work that features characters from their own culture.

5.5 Elizabeth Ebony Thomas: Stories still matter: Rethinking the role of diverse children's literature today

Published: 2016

What cultural group is being considered: Multicultural

What aspects of the text is this framework focused on: Thomas is focused on who has the power within children’s literature. She wants educators and librarians to think critically while they read texts and consider who this story is benefitting and how it could be told differently. Thomas is aiming to help the users of this framework to understand the pervasiveness of colonial narratives and consider how children’s literature can benefit colonisers as well as demonstrate how a book that is anti-colonial can benefit children and open them up to new ways of thinking about the world. Unlike previous frameworks, this one is not concerned with individual characters but rather the larger themes that make up the whole story. This is a distinct shift and shows a move from wanting to see characters and experiences a child can relate to and towards thinking about how a wider narrative is feeding into a larger cultural issues of colonialism and white supremacy and the lessons children are learning from these texts.

In what context was this framework created: This framework was written in 2016. Thomas makes reference to Black Lives Matter and the Syrian refugee crisis as examples of anti-colonial action. This shows that Thomas believes there is a wider problem of racist narratives within
children’s literature and that these stories contribute to wider problems of racism within society.

5.6 Eliza G. Braden and Sanjuana C. Rodriguez: Beyond Mirrors and Windows: A Critical Content Analysis of Latinx Children’s Books

**Published:** 2016

**What culture is this framework focused on:** Latinx

**What aspects of the text is this framework focused on:** This framework was developed using Critical Race Theory and therefore is focused on the power dynamics within the texts. The questions about cultural information for example, asks if the information is specific or stereotypical and if the characters can be considered individuals or caricatures? This framework is asking if a text feeds into wider societal assumptions about a particular minority group and the effects that has on children who read these stories. Braden and Rodriguez argue with their framework that you cannot have authentic cultural representation within a text unless that text empowers Latinx characters and displays them as unique individuals who hold the wisdom within a story and are not reliant on white characters. It is also the only framework that specifically addresses languages that are not English and shows how children’s books often privilege English over other languages.

**In what context was this framework created?** The phrase “Beyond Mirrors and Windows” in the title of this essay references an essay published by Bishop-Sims in 1990. This framework is aiming to build directly on Bishop-Sims original work about the need for culturally authentic children’s books using Critical Race Theory to show how important it is that the concept of power is considered when discussing these texts.

5.7 Framework Analysis Summary

This analysis of the frameworks shows that there are two distinct ways in which to address the issue of authentic cultural representation within children’s literature. The first is to address the representation of culture within a text. This method centers on the characters themselves, asking if they are given the opportunity to display their own culture, use the knowledge gained
from their culture and interact with other people from the same minority group. This type of cultural authenticity can be identified using frameworks such as Bishop-Sims (1993) or Hefflin and Barksdale-Ladd (2001). The second type of framework argues that authentic representation cannot happen unless the story is anti-racist and the themes within the story uplift minority cultures and dismantle the white supremacy seen in many traditional stories for children. This is shown in more recent frameworks such as Thomas, (2016) and Braden and Rodriguez, (2016). Any new framework would need to consider the needs of the cultural group in question and the country it is to be used within before deciding what approach would be best.

6. Application to a New Zealand Māori context

Examining previous frameworks shows that there are two ways of looking at the question of what makes a culturally authentic children’s book. The first is that a text must allow chances for a character to display their culture and the second is that a text needs to be free of racist and white dominated messaging in order to be considered truly culturally authentic.

It now needs to be considered which aspects of these would be most useful when applied to a New Zealand Māori context. As stated in the limitations section of this paper I am Pākehā and therefore unable to make claims about exactly what Māori consider to be most important aspects of their lives to be represented in their children’s literature. Even extensive reading about the Māori would view would not give me the right to decide this. Therefore, this project will take the biggest themes identified within the analysis of the original frameworks and broadly apply them to New Zealand history and the cultural landscape today. Those who have previously created frameworks are cultural insiders of minorities who have experienced racism and the effects of living in a white dominated society. They understand what children from a minority background need to see in a text and their insight can be trusted to inform the creation of a New Zealand framework that aims to uplift minority voices within children’s collections and help negate racist messaging. Therefore, this project will create a framework that will include the following three characteristics.
1. The identification of what racism can look like within a text and how to avoid racist or white dominated stories
2. The inclusion and correct use of Te Reo Māori
3. Identification in the text of a culture separate from white dominant norms

Creating a framework which helps address these three broad issues within children’s literature will demonstrate how this knowledge, developed in the United States would respond to a New Zealand Māori context and will answer the research questions about whether or not the significant amount of literature about culturally authentic children’s literature can be applied to New Zealand libraries.

6.1 White Dominance and Colonisation in New Zealand

There can be no discussion about Māori cultural representation without acknowledging the immense damage done by European colonisation from the first encounters between Māori and Pākehā since the mid 1600s until the present day. If Britain had not colonised New Zealand, Māori would still be the dominant culture and there would be no need for work such as this to help identify and uplift Māori culture within Pākehā institutions like a library. Any work done with the intention of uplifting and highlighting Māori culture and practices is completed at least in part as a response to the colonial practices of supplanting indigenous knowledge with their own way of life and forcing indigenous people to assimilate (Tuhiwai Smith, 2016). European colonists stole Māori land, forced them to assimilate into a white culture that saw them as lesser and killed thousands through war and disease. The traumatic effects of these brutal acts can still be felt today, with Māori more likely to be living below the poverty line, to be abused as children, to be incarcerated, to be addicted to drugs and significantly more likely to complete suicide than their white counterparts (Reid, Rout, Tau & Smith, 2017). Racist colonial beliefs that benefit Pākehā still exist today and can be seen today in a variety of ways, such as the New Zealand media trivialising and underreporting Māori successes, leading to belief amongst the public that Māori are less intelligent and therefore less able to lead (Pack, Tuffin & Lyons, 2016) and the pervasive narrative of New Zealand as an equal, egalitarian nation where Māori
themselves are at fault for being unable to succeed, despite the large amounts of evidence showing the disadvantages Māori face (Satherley & Sibley, 2018). These examples show how colonial narratives of Māori as both less intelligent and lazy continue to benefit Pākehā and allow them to keep control of the country. It needs to be noted that Libraries in New Zealand are majority white institutions, with roughly 89% of New Zealand library staff identifying as Pākehā/NZ European (Libraries Aotearoa, 2017). They are also colonial institutions, having been introduced by European settlers and because of their majority of white staff they are in danger of unconsciously reinforcing racist narratives about Māori and continue the culture of colonialism and Pākeha dominance in New Zealand. Therefore, any new framework developed for use in New Zealand will need to understand that colonial practices have created an unequal society which is still upheld today through racist myths about Māori and will need to include questions that help majority white librarians identify these racist myths in order to exclude texts that do contain them while selecting and promoting those that do not.

Thomas (2016) explicitly addresses colonialism as a force that needs counteracting within children’s literature within her framework, asking her readers to consider the metaphors we read by and consciously consider what cultural themes are imbedded within the text and who benefits by reasserting these themes within a children’s story. However, this does not mean that the other frameworks discussed cannot help create an understanding of how power and white supremacy can function within a children’s story. Colonisation is nothing more than white supremacy. It is the belief that white people know more about land, governance and society and therefore are allowed to force Indigenous people into subservience. These frameworks all understand what it means for white stories to be at the center of the majority of children’s literature and what that lack of a mirror showing their own lives can mean for non-white children.

6.2 Te Reo Māori and the Language Revival Movement

While only one framework explicitly addressed native language it is undeniable that Te Reo Māori is a fundamental part of Māori culture and must be included in any discussion about
cultural authenticity within Māori children’s literature. In 1985, Te Reo Māori was designated a national taonga (treasure) and was ruled that the Crown has a legal obligation to protect it under The Treaty of Waitangi (NZ History, 2017). This need for protection came about because of prior government initiatives to force Māori to assimilate into European society such as a Native Schools Act of 1867, which established a system of village schools and made attendance compulsory. The aim of these schools was to assimilate Māori with lessons only taught in English while the use of Te Reo was punished - often physically. Before World War Two most Māori spoke Te Reo as their first language but by the 1980s, only 20% of Māori were able to hold a conversation in Te Reo and there were fears the language would become extinct, (NZ History, 2017). The 2013 census showed that only 21.3% of Māori were able to hold a conversation in Te Reo, a decrease from 23.74% in the 2006 census. While interest in learning Te Reo has become significantly more popular with classes filling up months in advance (Freeman, 2018) and calls for Te Reo to be taught in all New Zealand schools (Hayden, 2019) it is far from the dominant language in New Zealand and is still very much secondary to English.

Braden and Rodriguez address indigenous language within their framework by asking, “Is English privileged within the texts?” (Braden & Rodriguez, 2016). They expected to find that the majority of books in their study were published in English as the study was conducted in the United States but were surprised that so many of the books which chose to include Spanish alongside the English did so in a way that privileged the English text. The layout of these books guided the reader towards the English first, putting in on the left page which is typically read first or by putting the Spanish underneath the English text, implying that it is secondary. Rodriguez and Braden argue that this implies that English is the most important language of the two and that the English reader is being privileged over the Spanish. This paper also identified a selection of books within their study which were primarily in English but used a variety of Spanish words throughout the text that were not translated. These were primarily kinship words, such as Abuela, Tio, Tia, Mami and Papi. Rodriguez and Braden found that the addition of these words significantly enhanced realism and cultural authenticity within the text (Braden and Rodriguez, 2016).
6.3 Māori Culture

The history of colonisation within New Zealand shows clearly that any framework considering Māori children’s literature needs to consider power dynamics and racist themes. However, it does not mean that the earlier frameworks which focus on characters and authentic cultural representation should be discounted. As stated previously, if colonisation had not happened there would be no need to create ways to assist in promoting Māori culture amongst the population as it would be the dominant culture throughout the country. Therefore, a text which Bishop-Sims would label culturally authentic, displaying Māori characters interacting with each other and their own culture is an anti colonial text, even if it does not include any overtly political or anti colonial themes. This is because assimilation is a colonising tool that Māori have been forced to fight against throughout British rule. Up until the 1960s the New Zealand government had a policy of monoculturalism and expected all Māori to do things the same as Pākehā would. Since the 1960s there has been significant efforts by Māori to “reclaim their past” with important, successful examples such as the 1975 land march and the recognition of Te Reo Māori as a national language (Thomas & Nikora, 1992) but the reality is that many Māori still feel as if they are expected to give up what makes them unique in order to succeed. A 2015 study found that Māori actively choose not to accentuate their Māori characteristics and culture in order to avoid racist attacks, increase their job opportunities and fit in better to their majority white schools and workplaces (Te Huia, 2015). Children’s literature is a medium that has the ability to display minority culture as normal and something that should be celebrated, as shown in the work done by the researchers cited in this paper. Books that are able to display authentic details of Māori culture are therefore essential, not only because they give Māori readers details to relate to within the text but also because they can become a voice against the mainstream pressure Māori feel to assimilate into Pākehā culture.

7. New Framework

The following is a framework created from the analysis of the original frameworks. Below each is a justification for its inclusion in order to be more methodical and increase transparency in case this study is ever replicated by another researcher.
1. **Are there Māori characters within the text and are the illustrations (if present) authentic representations of Māori people?**

It is obviously impossible to display cultural authenticity without a Māori character as they need to be present to tell their own story. The questions of culturally authentic illustrations comes from Hefflin and Barksdale-Ladd (2001). In their essay, they point out the differences between an illustration of an African American character, with distinctly African American features, hairstyle and clothing, and an illustration of a character with brown skin but otherwise typically white features. Māori bodies are different from Europeans, typically having bigger frames and more muscle mass (Swiburn, Ley, Carmichael & Plank, 1999) and while traditionally this larger body type was celebrated by Māori evidence shows that more Māori today see European bodies as an ideal standard of beauty and see themselves as less beautiful, (Ruchika, Carter & Gleave, 2012). Therefore, it is important that books about Māori characters reflect and celebrate their true bodies and not European norms in order to show Māori children that their own bodies are normal and beautiful, not just those of their Pākehā counterparts.

2. **Are the Māori characters given an opportunity to display their culture in a meaningful way?**

This question is based on frameworks such as, Bishop-Sims (1993) Yokota, (1993) and Hefflin & Barksdale-Ladd (2001) which argue that cultural authenticity is personal and should be reflected in a character’s actions so a child is able to make a connection with that character and therefore the text as a whole. According to Bishop-Sims (1993), authentic culture can be displayed in a variety of ways such as:

- Traditional clothing worn correctly at appropriate times
- Culturally authentic food, prepared and consumed in a culturally authentic way
- Authentic dialogue and language
- Religious beliefs
- Family configurations and relationships

Including these aspects of a culture, Bishop-Sims argues, takes a minority character from being a stereotype and turns them into a unique individual and someone deeply rooted in their culture (Bishop-Sims, 1993). For Māori characters, these forms of cultural authenticity could be demonstrated in a variety of ways such as the use of Ta Moko (traditional Māori tattoos) in the illustrations, depictions of tikanga (correct Māori cultural practices), Marae protocol and much, much more. Bishop-Sims says that while insiders of their culture will be able to spot cultural authenticity immediately it can be harder for outsiders and stresses that it is essential for white selectors to read widely within the culture in order to gain the insight needed to spot cultural authenticity within a text (Bishop-Sims, 1993).

3. What (or whose) view of the world, or kinds of behaviors are presented as normal by the text?

This question is taken directly from Thomas’ 2016 framework. It captures what librarians need to be thinking about when reading children’s literature in regards to power. The question is asking librarians to consider the underlying themes of the text and whether or not they will continue to perpetuate colonial myths told within New Zealand. In her book, Colonising Myths – Maori Realities: He Rukuruku Whakaaro, Mikaere argues that Pākehā hold a great deal of guilt about the colonisation of New Zealand and have created several coping mechanisms to deal with this guilt. These include choosing to forget unfavourable parts of history when convenient, insisting that colonisation was an overwhelmingly positive experience for Māori and arguing that New Zealand is an equal society that gives everyone an equal chance of success (Mikaere, 2013). Librarians have a responsibility to fight against mistruths and to help patrons of any age find reliable information about a topic. While Pākehā might hold onto a world view that the actions of their ancestors was just and that Māori do not suffer the long term effects of colonisation there is overwhelming evidence to the contrary and books that are unable to display these issues without promoting a Pākehā worldview of New Zealand need to be questioned by librarians in charge of children’s collection development.
This question also asks librarians to think about aspects of assimilation within the text. A character may look Māori in the illustrations but if they are not given a chance to display their culture it is impossible to tell for certain. Authentic depictions of culture help to show that the character is Māori if their identity is not explicitly stated within the text and it also helps to promote a Māori worldview. When a character is not given a chance to be an explicit part of a culture it often means that they are simply acting the same as a white character would, playing into the idea that what white people do is normal while the lives, knowledge and experiences of minority people are erased. Assuming a colour blind view point, which asserts that all experience is universal, ultimately disadvantages minorities as it teaches that their cultural knowledge is inferior while also failing to recognise that social inequalities that disadvantage them (Marcus, Steele & Steele, 2000). Books that allow non white characters to display their culture speak against a universal narrative and show that cultural diversity is normal and something to be celebrated.

4. How is Te Reo used within the text?

The inclusion of Te Reo within the text can be done in many different ways that can add to the cultural authenticity of the text. Firstly, Te Reo words can be used in place of English words throughout the text when appropriate as the inclusion of an indigenous language can help enhance realism and cultural authenticity within the text (Thomas, 2016). Secondly, librarians can select books that are either fully in Te Reo or include both English and Te Reo text. Those that include both languages need to be considered using Rodriguez and Braden’s (2016) critique of how the native language is placed in relation the English text. If one language has to be more prominent than the other, the Te Reo should be privileged over the English and placed on the left hand side of the page or above the English translation. If it is the other way around the book is confirming the idea that Te Reo is less important than English. Thirdly, all texts set in New Zealand should be vetted for correct spelling and use of macrons for any Te Reo loan words or Māori place name within the text. Macrons are an essential part of Te Reo and the use
of a macron can change the meaning of a word completely (for example, keke is cake but kēkē is armpit). They also show how a word should be said, with a macron over a vowel showing that the sound should be held longer and can often denote plurals (for example, matua is father but mātua is parents). Using Te Reo correctly shows a respect for the language and its history and demonstrates to readers the appropriate way to use Te Reo within a primarily English text.

7. Application of New Framework

The following is an example of how the framework can be used to analyse a small set of books. This is the short list for the 2019 Children’s Book Awards for Best Picture Book and has been chosen because the awards are widely publicized throughout New Zealand libraries, schools, bookstores and in the media. Libraries are likely to have multiple copies of each book and this small selection of books can be seen as an example of current popular trends in New Zealand children’s literature. Books that featured non white characters were analyzed using the framework as seen in the previous section. Those that did not feature any non-white characters were not analysed as the framework was not designed for this type of text but the setting was noted as choosing to set a book in New Zealand means that Māori people exist in the world of that book but were excluded from the story by the author.

**Mini Whinny: Happy Birthday to Me**

**Author:** Stacey Gregg  
**Illustrator:** Ruth Paul

This book does not include any Māori characters and therefore cannot be considered culturally authentic. The only hint that it is set in New Zealand is that the horses’ birthday is the 1st of August, the standardized birthday for horses in the Southern Hemisphere.

**Puffin the Architect**

**Author and Illustrator:** Kimberley Andrews
This book also does not include any Māori characters and its setting is most likely not New Zealand as puffins are more likely to be found in the Northern Hemisphere.

**The Bomb**

**Author:** Sacha Cotter  
**Illustrator:** Josh Morgan

**Does the book contain Māori characters:** Yes, this book is almost exclusively about Māori characters

**Are the illustrations culturally authentic:** Yes, the illustrations portray culturally authentic, realistic Māori people.

**Are Māori characters given an opportunity to display their culture within the text:** Yes, the characters are portrayed in the illustrations wearing pounamu and have Ta Moko (traditional tattoos). There are also small uses of Te Reo throughout the book and the main character is shown looking to their Grandmother for help - a traditional family configuration as elders within Māori are highly respected and are often sought out for advice on difficult matters (NZ History, 2011)

**How is Te Reo used within the text:** Te Reo is only used in the illustrations but it does add to the cultural details within the book.

**What (or whose) view of the world, or kinds of behaviors are presented as normal by the text:** The main characters Māori worldview is treated as normal throughout the text.

**Things in the Sea are Touching Me!**

**Author:** Linda Jane Keegan  
**Illustrator:** Minky Stapleton

**Does the book contain Māori characters:** Possibly, the daughter and one of the Mothers are both of Polynesian descent - but they could easily be Pasifika, not Māori.

**Are the illustrations culturally authentic:** Yes, the white mother looks visibly different from the other two characters who have authentic hairstyles and facial features.
Are Māori characters given an opportunity to display their culture: No, they are not and this is why it is impossible to tell if the two non white characters are Māori or Pasifika.

How is Te Reo used within the text: There is no Te Reo used in this text.

What (or whose) view of the world, or kinds of behaviors are presented as normal by the text: Bishop-Sims would consider this to be a “generic” book as the non white characters are only given an opportunity to explore a universal problem (being scared of what’s in the sea) and are not given an opportunity to display their own culture (Bishop-Sims, 1993). By erasing Māori culture and making the race of two characters undefinable this could be seen as an example of assimilation within a children’s book.

Who Stole the Rainbow

Author and Illustrator: Vasanti Unka

This text only has animals as characters and is only identifiable as being set in New Zealand because of a picture of a weather map of New Zealand.

8. Discussion

This small analysis not only displays how this framework can be used, it also shows why it is necessary to consider if there are identifiably Māori characters within a text and how they are portrayed. Of these five children’s books only one would be considered to be culturally authentic and unquestionably contains Māori characters. In fact, the majority of books contained animals, not human characters. While some may think that animals could be considered culturally neutral and characters that would appeal to all children of any background, Hefflin and Barksdale-Ladd argue that if non white children are only ever given books about animals and never see themselves reflected on the page they will feel as if they are not meant to read (Hefflin & Barksdale-Ladd, 2001). Therefore, books with animals as characters still need to be considered to be pushing a colour blind narrative which can alienate children of minorities. This lack of Māori characters is made worse when it is shown that all but one of these books was set in New Zealand, meaning that Māori do exist in the world of these books but were erased from the majority of these stories.
With only two of the five books analysed featuring non-white human characters it is clear that New Zealand does suffer similar problems to the United States in regards to the lack of culturally authentic books for children of minorities. The lack of cultural authenticity within this selection of picture books highlights why it is so important for librarians working in New Zealand to consider how many books they have that feature Māori characters and whether or not the characters in those books are able to display their differences in more ways than illustrations coloured brown. The two books about human characters both included non-white characters but only one could be considered culturally authentic based on the developed framework. The most culturally authentic book was The Bomb. What is interesting about this is that while the author, Sasha Cotter is white, the illustrator, Josh Morgan is Māori. This is important because the majority of the cultural details within the book came from the illustrations. It was here that the reader could see the characters with authentic Māori bodies, wearing pounamu and using Te Reo Māori. It is this obvious inclusion of authentic cultural representation in the illustrations that makes the decision of the main character to talk to his Grandmother feel like a culturally authentic detail that reflected Māori familial structures. In comparison, Things in the Sea are Touching Me! has an author and an illustrator that are both white and were as such unable to include culturally authentic details and therefore it is impossible to tell if her characters are Māori or not. The discussion of whether or not cultural outsiders are able to write books about other groups is a topic of contention, with most insiders believing that only someone who is a part of their culture would be able to accurately portray their experiences within a text (Yokota, 1993). This small application of the framework seems to support this belief, with a Māori illustrator adding the most culturally authentic details. It should also be noted that both of these books are available in Te Reo which would significantly increase the cultural authenticity of both. However, as the roughly 80% of Māori who are not able to hold a conversation in Te Reo should still be able to access culturally authentic books the decision was made to analyse the English version.
Of the five books chosen to be analysed none had a historical setting and therefore did not have explicit messaging about New Zealand’s colonial history. This reflects a problem with the small sample size and the time and resource constraints of the 580 research project, not the questions as New Zealand’s history remains a popular topic with children’s book authors and illustrators. For example, a finalist for 2019 New Zealand Children’s Book Award for Illustrations is, *Cook’s Cook: The Cook who Cooked for Captain Cook*. This book features Captain Cook, the British explorer who visited New Zealand in 1769 and created the first European maps of the Southern Hemisphere who is also often incorrectly billed by Pākehā as the person who discovered New Zealand. This book would very obviously need to be read closely for its messaging about Captain Cook and its ability to tell a historically accurate story that did not frame him as hero or the discoverer of New Zealand but rather someone who while important to New Zealand history is also responsible for the deaths of nine Māori in Gisborne in 1769 and many other atrocities towards indigenous people in the Pacific Region (Johnsen, 2019). A framework for children’s stories needs to be able to deal with a myriad of potential plotlines that could not all be showcased within the analysis portion of this research project.

The aim of frameworks like this is to help selectors think critically about the books they are buying for children and seriously consider if their collection has enough material for Māori children. As demonstrated above, the questions chosen for the framework give librarians an opportunity to think about how the text is constructed, what information the author has chosen to include about the characters and what has been left out. The analysis of *Things in the Sea are Touching Me!* shows this best. It would be easy for a white librarian who is unaware of the importance of cultural authenticity within children’s books to see the depictions of brown characters and think that constitutes cultural authenticity and positive representation for a non-white child. However, a framework like this teaches the librarian not just to look at the colour of the characters skin but also at the actions of the characters and if they are able to interact or display their culture in a more meaningful and explicit way. By teaching that looking for these details within a text is important librarians will become more attuned to how culture is portrayed or erased within children’s literature.
9. Limitations of the Project and Suggestions for Future Research

This research was designed at a first attempt at using literature and research from the United States to assess cultural authenticity within a New Zealand context. A version of this project was considered which involved interviewing Māori in order to understand their needs but it was discarded as it would be seen as inappropriate for me as an inexperienced Pākehā researcher to approach Māori for interviews about their own culture and use it for research that primarily benefited my own academic goals. Māori have a fraught relationship with western research, having seen their indigenous knowledge “extracted, appropriated and distributed” across the world by white academics labelled as experts by a Western system of knowledge that saw indigenous people as unintelligent and unimportant (Tuhiwai Smith, 2012). The project in its current form allowed for the testing of important ideas concerning the selection of children’s literature and demonstrate its potential usefulness within a New Zealand context without causing any harm to potential Māori participants. However, the broad application of the concerns of minorities living within the United States to a New Zealand Māori context can be seen as a significant limitation to this research and therefore the framework developed within this research project should not be implemented in any library in its current form without vetting from Māori. In addition, it is recommended that any future framework developed would need to be created in conversation with Māori before it is utilised in a library setting. It should also be noted that due to the time and resource constraints of the 580 research project it was only possible to test the new framework designed through this research by analysing a very small selection of New Zealand picture books. Further research would most likely also need to include the testing of a wider sample of books in order to obtain more results.

10. Conclusion

This study demonstrates how literature from the United States can be used to help librarians think more critically about children’s literature in their current collections and what to look for when adding new books to their children’s collections. By analysing the original frameworks and identifying what experts in children’s literature and cultural insiders considered to be
cultural authenticity a framework was created that was able to critique the cultural authenticity found in New Zealand children’s literature. The creation of this framework shows that this knowledge can be applied to a New Zealand context and would help librarians critique the ways in which Māori are either portrayed or excluded from New Zealand children’s literature.

It is clear from the work done in the United States that non white children need to have easy access to books that reflect their own lives and cultural experiences. It is also clear that within the United States children of minorities struggle to access these children’s books. The analysis done in this project of the New Zealand Picture Book Awards shortlist suggests that Māori children also struggle to find culturally authentic books and are suffering in the same way non white children in the United States do. Therefore, the framework developed in this research project, based on those developed in the United States to help fix their problems of representation would be helpful for New Zealand librarians. This research project has demonstrated how a framework such as this one would help New Zealand librarians think critically about the books they are adding into their children’s collections and also raise awareness amongst selectors about the importance of obtaining culturally authentic Māori children’s books for their libraries.

Libraries and librarians see themselves as important social institutions that give the public the ability to access to a plethora of materials that they would otherwise be unable to use. However, New Zealand libraries are still majority white institutions and are therefore at risk of ignoring the needs of patrons from different cultural and racial backgrounds. Tools like the framework developed in this research project can help ensure libraries understand how important it is that their collection is as diverse as possible and know what to look for when purchasing books about Māori characters.
11. References


Word Count: 9066, excluding references and table of contents.